

Multilateral Cooperation and Complexity

Instructor: Stephanie Hofmann

Contact: Sofia.Altisini@eui.eu

Dates and schedule:

Thursday	05 June @ Badia Fiesolana, Seminar Room 2 from 09:00 until 13:00
Monday	09 June @ Badia Fiesolana, Seminar Room 2 from 09:00 until 13:00
Tuesday	10 June @ Badia Fiesolana, Seminar Room 2 from 09:00 until 13:00
Wednesday	11 June @ Badia Fiesolana, Seminar Room 2 from 09:00 until 13:00
Thursday	12 June @ Badia Fiesolana, Seminar Room 2 from 09:00 until 13:00

Credits: 20

Outline

Over the last decades, the number of international organizations has grown rapidly across policy domains such as security, trade, human rights, cyber, or development aid. Not only have new organizations been created but existing ones also expanded their scope. As a result, what has been governed through relatively disconnected international treaties and agreements before, is today subject to actor density and complex inter-organizational relationships. In this seminar, we ask whether this growth in organizations has transformed the ways in which we think of global governance and multilateral cooperation? In addressing this question, more questions arise such as: Which actors push for what kind of institutional change? Do we observe differences across policy domains and/or regions? How do transnational crises impact global governance arrangements?

We will examine these questions by reviewing theoretical and empirical scholarship on international organizations. We first revisit theoretical and conceptual debates on international organizations and global governance. We do so to distill key assumptions and mechanisms on which current theories (might still) rest. Second, we discuss different sets of organizational forms (e.g. formal and informal institutions, multistakeholder institutions) and actors (e.g. IO bureaucracy, nonstate actors) to gain a better understanding of the governance space. And we turn to the recent debate on 'regime complexity'. We examine whether and under what conditions the existing assumptions and mechanisms still hold in a densely institutionalized space.

With a focus on density and complexity, we move away from studying organizations in isolation from one another and only focusing on few rich, resourceful and powerful organizations. Instead, we will gain a more nuanced understanding of when, where and how organizations can make a difference (for a few actors or many).

Course requirements consist of

- **Complete the readings and active participation** in the seminar discussions and debates, e.g. contributing to addressing broader issues and questions underlying the

readings, identifying strengths and problems with theory & research design as well as discussing potential room for revisions.

- **authors' defendant** (1x), that is, defend the merits of some readings in class.
- **2-3 discussion questions** (1x) with a short explanation of why these questions occurred to you. Please circulate these questions to the entire class via email no later than one day before class.

Authors' defendant and discussion questions must be completed on separate weeks. To receive credit for this seminar, you must get a pass on each of them.

Readings

Session 1a+b (June 5). Global governance & multilateralism

Weiss, Jessica Chen and Jeremy Wallace. 2021. "Domestic Politics, China's Rise, and the Future of the Liberal International Order." *International Organization* 75, 2: 635-664.

Anderl, Felix, Priska Daphi and Nicole Deitelhoff. 2021. "Keeping Your Enemies Close? The Variety of Social Movements' Reactions to International Organizations' Opening Up." *International Studies Review* 23, 4: 1273-1299.

Pouliot, Vincent. 2011. "Multilateralism as an End in Itself." *International Studies Perspectives* 12, 1 : 18-26.

Martin, Lisa. 1992. "Interests, Power, and Multilateralism." *International Organization* 46, 4: 765-792.

Roger, Charles and Sam Rowan. 2022. "Analyzing International Organizations: How the concepts we use affect the answers we get." *Review of International Organizations* 17: 597-625.

If you have not read them (in a long time), please skim:

Rosenau, James. 1992. *Governance without Government*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Chapter 1.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Biersteker, Thomas. 2009. "Global Governance." In Myriam Dunn Cavelty and Victor Mauer (eds.) *Routledge Companion to Security*. New York and London: Routledge Publishers, pp. 439-451.

Zürn, Michael. 2018. *A Theory of Global Governance. Authority, Legitimacy, and Contestation*. Cambridge: Oxford University Press.

Chanda, Nayan. 2008. "Runaway Globalization without Governance." *Global Governance* 14, 2: 119-125.

Stone, David, R. 2000. "Imperialism and Sovereignty: The League of Nations' Drive to Control the Global Arms Trade." *Journal of Contemporary History* 35, 2: 213-230.

Wilson, Woodrow. 1918. "The Fourteen Points speech."
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1918wilson.html>

Ruggie, John. 1993. *Multilateralism Matters: the Theory and Praxis of an International Forum*. New York: Columbia University Press, Chapter 1.

Schroeder, Paul. 1989. "The nineteenth century system: balance of power or political equilibrium?" *Review of International Studies* 15, 2: 135-154.

Finnemore, Martha. 2014. "Dynamics of Global Governance: Building on What We Know." *International Studies Quarterly* 58, 1: 221-4.

Stephen, Matthew D. 2017. "Emerging Powers and Emerging Trends in Global Governance." *Global Governance* 23, 3: 483-5502.

Weiss, Thomas and Rorden Wilkinson. 2014. "Rethinking Global Governance? Complexity, Authority, Power, Change." *International Studies Quarterly* 58, 1: 207-15.

Downs, George W., David M. Rocke, and Peter N. Barsoom. 1998. "Managing the Evolution of Multilateralism." *International Organization* 52, 2: 397-419.

Shanks, Cheryl, Harold K. Jacobson, and Jeffrey H. Kaplan. 1996. "Inertia and Change in the Constellation of International Governmental Organizations, 1981-1992." *International Organization* 50, 4: 593-627.

Liebowitz, S. J. and Stephen E. Margolis. 1995. "Path Dependence, Lock-In, and History." *Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization* 11, 1: 205-26.

Carter, David B., and Randall W. Stone. 2015. "Multilateralism and Democracy: The Case of Vote Buying in the United Nations General Assembly." *International Organization* 69, 1: 1-33.

Kuziemko, Ilyana and Eric Werker. 2006. "How Much Is a Seat on the Security Council Worth? Foreign Aid and Bribery at the United Nations." *Journal of Political Economy* 114, 4: 905-30.

Session 2a (June 9). International organizations and their designs

Johnston, Alastair Iain. 2001. "Treating International Institutions as Social Environments." *International Studies Quarterly* 45, 4: 487-515.

Roger, Charles and Sam Rowan. 2023. "The New Terrain of Global Governance: Mapping Membership in Informal Interantional Organizations." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 67, 6: 1248-1269.

Barnett, Michael and Etel Solingen. 2007. "Designed to Fail or Failure of Design? The Origins and Legacy of the Arab League," in Amitav Acharya and Alastair Iain Johnston, eds. *Crafting Cooperation: Regional International Institutions in Comparative Perspective*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 180-220.

Snidal, Duncan and Felicity Vabulas. 2013. "Organization without Delegation: Informal intergovernmental organizations (IIGOs)." *Review of International Organizations* 8, 2: 193-220.

If you have not read them (in a long time), please skim:

Koremenos, Barbara, Charles Lipson, and Duncan Snidal. 2001. "The Rational Design of International Institutions." *International Organization* 55, 4: 761-799.

Keohane, Robert. O. 1984. *After Hegemony*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, Chapters 4 and 6, pp. 49-65; 85-109.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Abbott, Kenneth and Duncan Snidal. 1998. "Why States Act Through Formal International Organizations." *The Journal of Conflict Resolution* 42, 1: 3-32.

Axelrod, Robert and Robert Keohane. 1985. "Achieving Cooperation Under Anarchy: Strategies and Institutions." *World Politics* 38, 1: 226-54.

Mearsheimer, John. 1994-95. "The False Promise of International Institutions." *International Security* 19: 5-49.

Erik Voeten. 2019. "Making Sense of the Design of International Institutions." *Annual Review of Political Science* 22: 147-63.

Ruggie, John G. "International Regimes, Transactions, and Change: Embedded Liberalism in the Postwar Economic System." *International Organization* 36, 2: 379-415.

Tsebelis, George and Geoffrey Garrett. 2001. "The Institutional Foundations of Intergovernmentalism and Supranationalism in the European Union." *International Organization* 55, 2: 357-390.

Acharya, Amitav, and Alastair Iain Johnston. 2007. "Comparing Regional Institutions: An Introduction," in *Crafting Cooperation: Regional International Institutions in Comparative Perspective*, Amitav Acharya and Alastair Iain Johnston, eds. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1-31.

Orfeo Fioretos. 2017. "Institutions and Time in International Relations" in *International Politics and Institutions in Time*. Oxford University Press.

Abbott, Kenneth and Duncan Snidal. 2000. "Hard and Soft Law in International Governance." *International Organization* 54, 3: 421-456.

Kucik, Jeffrey and Eric Reinhardt. 2008. "Does Flexibility Promote Cooperation? An Application to the Global Trade Regime." *International Organization* 62, 3: 477-505.

Johnson, Tana. 2013. "Looking beyond States: Openings for international bureaucrats to enter the institutional design process." *The Review of International Organizations* 8, 4: 499-519.

Mitchell, Ronald. 1994. "Regime Design Matters: Intentional Oil Pollution and Treaty Compliance." *International Organization* 48, 3: 425-58

Kahler, Miles. 2000. "Legalization as Strategy: The Asia-Pacific Case." *International Organization* 54, 3: 549-71.

Leggold, Joseph. 1998. "NATO's Post-Cold War Collective Action Problem." *International Security* 23, 1: 78-106.

Kleine, Mareike. 2014. "Informal governance as a new research agenda in EU Studies." *Journal for European Public Policy* 21: 2.

Haftel, Yoram and Stephanie C. Hofmann. 2017. "Institutional Authority and Security Cooperation within Regional Economic Organizations." *Journal of Peace Research* 54, 4: 484-498.

Duffield, John S. 2003. "The Limits of Rational Design." *International Organization* 57(2): 411-30.

Session 2b (June 9). Membership, withdrawal and IO death

Davis, Christina and Meredith Wilf. 2017. "Joining the Club: Accession to the GATT/WTO." *Journal of Politics* 79, 3: 964-978.

Eilstrup-Sangiovanni, Mette. 2018. "Death of international organizations. The organizational ecology of intergovernmental organizations, 1815-2015." *Review of International Organizations*

Ravndal, Ellen J. 2020. "Colonies, semi-sovereigns, and great powers: IGO membership debates and the transition of the international system." *Review of International Studies* 46: 278-298.

Inken von Borzyskowski and Felicity Vabulas. 2019. "Hello, Goodbye: When do States Withdraw from International Organizations?," *The Review of International Organizations*

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Gray, Julia. 2018. "Life, Death, or Zombie? The Vitality of International Organizations." *International Studies Quarterly* 62, 1: 1-13.

Stone, Randall W. 2008. "The Scope of IMF Conditionality." *International Organization* 62, 4: 589-620.

Zürn, Michael. 2021. "How Non-Majoritarian Institutions Make Silent Majorities Vocal. A Political Explanation of Authoritarian Populism". *Perspectives on Politics*, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S1537592721001043>.

Broz, J. Lawrence, Zhiwen Zhang, and Gaoyang Wang. 2020. "Explaining Foreign Support for China's Global Economic Leadership." *International Organization* 74, 3: 417-452.

Schneider, Christina. 2011. "Weak States and Institutionalized Bargaining Power in International Organizations." *International Studies Quarterly* 55, 2: 331-355.

Kahler, Miles. 1992. "Multilateralism with Small and Large Numbers." *International Organization* 46, 3: 681- 708.

Keohane, Robert O. 1969. "Lilliputians' Dilemmas: Small States in International Politics." *International Organization* 23, 2: 291-310.

Panke, Diana. 2010. "Small states in the European Union: structural disadvantages in EU policy-making and counter-strategies." *Journal of European Public Policy* 17, 6: 799-817.

Session 3a (June 10). Privatization and hybrid authority

Guest lecturer: Juanita Uribe

Andonova, Liliana B. 2010. "Public-Private Partnerships for the Earth: Politics and Patterns of Hybrid Authority in the Multilateral System." *Global Environmental Politics* 10, 2: 25-53.

Büthe, Tim and Walter Mattli. 2011. *The New Global Rulers: The Privatization of Regulation in the World Economy*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, Chapter 2.

Hall, Rodney and Thomas Biersteker. 2003. *The Emergence of Private Authority in Global Governance*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Chapter 1, pp. 3-21; Chapter 10, pp. 203-222.

Uribe, Juanita. 2024. "Governing on par with states: private power and practices of political normalisation.", *Review of International Studies* 2024: 1-20.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Littoz-Monnet, Annabelle. 2017. "Expert Knowledge as a Strategic Resource: International Bureaucrats and the Shaping of Bioethical Standards." *International Studies Quarterly* 61, 3: 584-595.

Nielson, Daniel L. and Michael J. Tierney. 2003. "Delegation to International Organizations: Agency Theory and World Bank Environmental Reform." *International Organization* 57, 2: 241-276.

Barnett, Michael N. and Martha Finnemore. 1999. "The Politics, Power, and Pathologies of International Organizations." *International Organization* 53, 4: 699-732.

Hofferberth, Matthias and Daniel Lambach. 2022. "Becoming global governors: Self-agentification, recognition, and delegation in world politics.", *Global Studies Quarterly* 2,3: ksac018;

Raymond, Mark and Laura DeNardis. 2015. "Multistakeholderism: anatomy of an inchoate global institution." *International Theory*, 7,3: 572-616.

Pollack, Mark A. 2003. *The engines of European integration: delegation, agency, and agenda setting in the EU*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Beach, Derek. 2004. "The unseen hand in treaty reform negotiations: the role and influence of the Council Secretariat." *Journal of European Public Policy* 11, 3: 408-439.

Johnson, Tana and Johannes Urpelainen. 2014. "International Bureaucrats and the Formation of Intergovernmental Organizations: Institutional Design Discretion Sweetens the Pot." *International Organization* 68, 1: 175-208.

Reinalda, Bob & Bertjan Verbeek. 2014. "Leadership of International Organizations," in Paul 't Hart & R.A.W. Rhodes (eds), *Oxford Handbook of Political Leadership*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 595-609.

Bartely, Tim. 2018. "Transnational Corporations and Global Governance." *Annual Review of Sociology* 145-165.

Martinez-Diaz, Leonardo. 2009. "Boards of directors in IOs: A framework for understanding the dilemmas of institutional design." *Review of International Organizations* 4, 4: 383.

Finnemore, Martha. 1996. National Interests in International Society. (New York: Cornell University) Chapter 4 (Norms and Development: The World Bank and Poverty), pp. 89-127.

Zürn, Michael, Martin Binder, Matthias Ecker-Ehrhardt. 2012. "International Authority and Its Politicization". *International Theory - A Journal of International Politics, Law and Philosophy* 4, 1: 69-106.

Heiss, A, and Tana Johnson. 2016. "Internal, Interactive, and Institutional Factors: A Unified Framework for Understanding International Nongovernmental Organizations." *International Studies Review* 18, 3: 528-541.

Turner, Scott. 1998. "Global Civil Society, Anarchy and Governance: Assessing an Emerging Paradigm." *Journal of Peace Research* 35, 1: 25-42.

Krisch, Nico. 2014. "The Decay of Consent: International Law in an Age of Global Public Goods." *American Journal of International Law* 108: 1-40.

Keck, Margaret E., and Kathryn Sikkink. 1998. "Transnational Advocacy Networks in International Politics: Introduction." *Activists Beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Session 3b (June 10).

tbc

Session 4a. International organizations and transnational crises

Guest lecturer: Christian Kreuder-Sonnen

Boin, Arjen (2019): The Transboundary Crisis: Why we are unprepared and the road ahead. In *Journal of Contingencies and Crisis Management* 27 (1), pp. 94–99.

Olsson, Eva-Karin; Verbeek, Bertjan (2018): International organisations and crisis management: Do crises enable or constrain IO autonomy? In *Journal of International Relations and Development* 21 (2), pp. 275–299.

Blondin, Donald; Boin, Arjen (2020): Cooperation in the Face of Transboundary Crisis: A Framework for Analysis. In *Perspectives on Public Management and Governance* 3 (3), pp. 197–209.

Kreuder-Sonnen, Christian (2019): International authority and the emergency problematic: IO empowerment through crises. In *International Theory* 11 (2), pp. 182–210.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Kreuder-Sonnen, Christian; Tantow, Philip M. (2023): Crisis and Change at IOM: Critical Juncture, Precedents, and Task Expansion. In Cathryn Costello, Megan Bradley, Angela Sherwood (Eds.): *IOM Unbound? Obligations and Accountability of the International Organization for Migration in an Era of Expansion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 187–212.

Debre, Maria J.; Dijkstra, Hylke (2021): COVID-19 and Policy Responses by International Organizations: Crisis of Liberal International Order or Window of Opportunity? In *Global Policy* 12 (4), pp. 443–454.

Haftel, Yoram Z.; Wajner, Daniel F.; Eran, Dan (2020): The Short and Long(er) of It: The Effect of Hard Times on Regional Institutionalization. In *International Studies Quarterly* 64 (4), pp. 808–820.

Biermann, Felix; Daßler, Benjamin (2024): The Contender's Momentum? COVID-19 and IO Relations in the Regime Complex of Financial Assistance. In *The Chinese Journal of International Politics* 17 (4), pp. 346–378.

Session 4b (June 11). Contestation

tbc

Session 5a (June 12). Regime complexity – structural accounts

Biermann, Frank, Philipp Pattberg, Harro van Asselt, and Fariborz Zelli. 2009. "The fragmentation of global governance architectures: A framework for analysis." *Global Environmental Politics* 9, 4: 14–40.

Gehring, Thomas and Benjamin Faude. 2014. "A theory of emerging order within institutional complexes: How competition among regulatory international institutions leads to institutional adaptation and division of labor." *Review of International Organization*, 9, 4: 471-498.

Zürn, Michael. 2017. "From Constitutional Rule to Loosely Coupled Spheres of Liquid Authority. A Reflexive Approach." *International Theory - A Journal of International Politics, Law and Philosophy* 9, 2: 261-285.

Pratt, Tyler. 2018. "Deference and Hierarchy in International Regime Complexes." *International Organization* 72, 3: 561-590.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Abbott, Kenneth W. and Duncan Snidal. 2010. "International regulation without international government: Improving IO performance through orchestration." *The Review of International Organizations* 5, 3: 315-344.

Morin, Jean-Frédéric and Amandine Orsini. 2013. "Regime Complexity and Policy Coherency: Introducing a Co-adjustments Model." *Global Governance: A Review of Multilateralism and International Organizations*. 19, 1: 41-51.

Frederick Heussner, Xenia Lanzendörfer, Andreas Kruck, and Bernhard Zangl. 2016. "Imperfect Adaptation. How the WTO and the IMF Adjust to Shifting Power Distributions among their

Members." *The Review of International Organization* 11, 2: 171-196.

Raustiala, Kal, and David G. Victor. 2004. "The Regime Complex for Plant Genetic Resources." *International Organization* 58, 2: 277-309.

Krisch, Nico. 2011. "Who is Afraid of Radical Pluralism? Legal Order and Political Stability in the Postnational Space." *Ratio Juris* 24: 386-412.

Urpelainen, Johannes and Thijs van de Graaf. 2015. "Your Place or Mine? Institutional Capture and the Creation of Overlapping International Institutions." *British Journal of Political Science* 45, 4: 799 .

Haftel, Yoram and Stephanie C. Hofmann. 2019. "Rivalry and Overlap: Why Regional Economic Organizations Encroach on Security Organizations." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 63, 9: 2180-2206.

Keohane, Robert O. and David G. Victor. 2011. "The Regime Complex for Climate Change." *Perspectives on Politics* 9, 1: 7-23.

Orsini, Amandine, Jean-Frederic Morin and Oran Young. 2013. "Regime Complexes: A Buzz, a Boom, or a Boost for Global Governance?" *Global Governance* 19, 1: 27-39.

Aggarwal, Vinod K. ed. 1998. *Institutional Designs for a Complex World. Bargaining, Linkages, and Nesting*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

Faude, Benjamin and Michal Parizek. 2020. "Contested multilateralism as credible signaling: how strategic inconsistency can induce cooperation among states." *Review of International Organizations*.

Morin, Jean-Frédéric, Joost Pauwelyn, and James Hollway. 2017. "The Trade Regime as a Complex Adaptive System: Exploration and Exploitation of Environmental Norms in Trade Agreements." *Journal of International Economic Law* 20, 2: 365–90.

Heldt, Eugénia C. and Henning Schmidtke 2019. "Explaining coherence in international regime complexes: How the World Bank shapes the field of multilateral development finance." *Review of International Political Economy* 26, 6: 1160-1186.

Abbott, Kenneth W., Jessica F. Green, and Robert O. Keohane. 2016. "Organizational Ecology and Institutional Change in Global Governance." *International Organization* 70, 2: 247-277.

Axelrod, Mark. 2014. "Clash of the treaties: Responding to institutional interplay in European Community-Chile swordfish negotiations." *European Journal of International Relations* 20,4: 987-1013.

Session 5b (June 12) 10. Configuring complexity

Drezner, Daniel. 2009. "The Power and Peril of International Regime Complexity." *Perspectives on Politics* 7, 1: 65-70.

Faude, Benjamin and Felix Große-Kreul. 2020. "Let's Justify! How Regime Complexes Enhance the Normative Legitimacy of Global Governance." *International Studies Quarterly* 64, 2: 431-439.

Hofmann, Stephanie C. and Patryk Pawlak. 2023. "Governing Cyberspace: Policy Boundary Politics Across Organizations." *Review of International Political Economy* 30, 6: 2122-2149.

Fioretos, Orfeo and Stephanie C. Hofmann. Unpublished manuscript. *Experiencing Worlds of Complexity: Creative Agency and Global Governance in Time*. Introduction.

Further readings, in case this topic interests you:

Kuyper, Jonathan W. "Global democratization and international regime complexity." *European Journal of International Relations* 20, 3: 620-646.

Busch, Marc L. 2007. "Overlapping Institutions, Forum Shopping, and Dispute Settlement in International Trade." *International Organization* 61, 4: 735-761.

Alter, Karen J., and Sophie Meunier. 2009. "The Politics of International Regime Complexity." *Perspectives on Politics* 7, 1: 13-24.

Benvenisti, Eyal and George W. Downs. 2007. "The Empire's New Cloths: Political Economy and the Fragmentation of International Law." *Stanford Law Review* 60, 2: 595-631.

Jupille, Joseph, Walter Mattli and Duncan Snidal. 2013. *Institutional Choice and Global Commerce*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Colgan, Jeff D., Robert O. Keohane and Thijs Van de Graaf. 2012. "Punctuated equilibrium in the energy regime complex." *Review of International Organizations* 7: 117-143.

Hofmann, Stephanie C. 2011. "Why Institutional Overlap Matters: CSDP in the European Security Architecture." *Journal of Common Market Studies* 49, 1: 101-120.

Helfer, Laurence. 2009. "Regime Shifting in the Intellectual Property System." *Perspectives on Politics* 7, 1: 39-44.

Muzaka, Valbona. 2010. "Linkages, contests and overlaps in the global intellectual property rights regime." *European Journal of International Relations* 17, 4: 755-776.

Morse, Julia C. and Robert O. Keohane. 2014. "Contested Multilateralism." *The Review of International Organizations* 9, 4: 385-412.

Hofmann, Stephanie C. 2019. "The Politics of Overlapping Organizations: Hostage-taking, Forum shopping, and Brokering." *Journal of European Public Policy* 26,6: 883-905.